

TRAFFORD COUNCIL

DELEGATED OFFICER DECISION REPORT

Report to: Corporate Director, Place
Date: 24th February 2020
Report for: Decision
Report of: Head of Regulatory Services

Report Title

Greater Manchester's Clean Air Plan – Tackling Nitrogen Dioxide Exceedances at the Roadside – Further Supplementary Information to accompany the Outline Business Case – Notes 30 to 32

Summary

The Greater Manchester Clean Air Plan (GM CAP) is underpinned by analysis and modelling using the best data and tools available. The results of this analysis are presented throughout the Outline Business Case (OBC) and have been written up in full in a series of Technical Reports. These Technical Reports have been produced in line with JAQU guidance.

Technical Reports 1 to 29 were approved by the Corporate Director, Place on 13th February 2020. The purpose of this report is to summarise the purpose and contents of three additional supplementary Technical Reports, and to seek approval for their submission to government's Joint Air Quality Unit to accompany the OBC.

A report that set out the progress that has been made following the Government's response to the OBC was considered on 6th January 2020 at the Council's Executive meeting. At this time a delegation was given to the Corporate Director, Place to approve the submission of this supplementary information.

Recommendation(s)

The Corporate Director, Place is recommended:

- (i) to approve the following documents for submission to the government's Joint Air Quality Unit; and
- (ii) to note their publication status as set out in the report.
 30. GM CAP: Alternative Sensitivity Test Modelling Summary*
 31. GM CAP: Results of tests to assess the optimal charge levels for a Greater Manchester Clean Air Zone*

Contact person for access to background papers and further information:

Name: Nigel Smith
Extension: 4530

1 Background

- 1.1 In July 2017 the Secretary of State issued a Direction under the Environment Act 1995 requiring seven Greater Manchester local authorities, including Trafford Council, to produce a feasibility study to identify the option which will deliver compliance with the requirement to meet legal limits for nitrogen dioxide in the shortest possible time.
- 1.2 In accordance with this Direction, Trafford Council has been developing the study collectively with the other 9 Greater Manchester local authorities and the GMCA, coordinated by TfGM in line with Government direction and guidance and an Outline Business Case (OBC) was duly submitted in March 2019.
- 1.3 The key features of Greater Manchester's feasibility study and its Outline Business Case (OBC) to reduce nitrogen dioxide exceedances in Trafford and across Greater Manchester in the shortest possible time were approved on 18th March 2019 at the Council's Executive meeting for submission to the government's Joint Air Quality Unit (JAQU).
- 1.4 Ministerial feedback was received in July 2019 along with a further direction under the Environment Act 1995 which requires all ten of the Greater Manchester local authorities to take steps to implement a plan to deliver compliance with the requirement to meet legal limits for nitrogen dioxide in the shortest possible time.
- 1.5 The ministerial letter that accompanied the July 2019 direction requested from GM further options appraisal information (including transport and air quality modelling as well as due regard to economic, financial and deliverability considerations) to be submitted prior to statutory consultation.
- 1.6 A report that set out the progress that has been made following the Government's response to Greater Manchester's Outline Business Case to tackle Nitrogen Dioxide Exceedances at the Roadside (OBC), and the implications for the 10 Greater Manchester (GM) local authorities in relation to the schedule of work and statutory consultation on the Clean Air Plan, was considered on 6th January 2020 at the Council's Executive meeting.
- 1.7 At this time a delegation was given to the Corporate Director, Place to approve the submission of supplementary information.

1.8 In response to the Ministerial request 32 Evidence Notes have been produced. Notes 1 to 29 were approved by the Corporate Director, Place on 13th February 2020. This report considers Notes 30 to 32.

2 Introduction

2.1 The Greater Manchester Clean Air Plan (GM CAP) is underpinned by analysis and modelling using the best data and tools available. The results of this analysis are presented throughout the OBC and have been written up in full in a series of Technical Reports. These Technical Reports have been produced in line with JAQU guidance.

2.2 The purpose of this report is to summarise the purpose and contents of three additional supplementary technical Evidence Notes that are required to be formally submitted to JAQU to accompany the OBC and in response to the Minister's feedback.

3 Purpose of the analysis and modelling

3.1 Pursuant to the Ministerial Direction, and in discussions with the government's Joint Air Quality Unit (JAQU), GM has updated analysis that addresses issues raised around the behavioural assumptions used and provided assurance that the proposed Clean Air Zone will deliver compliance in the shortest possible time, and that compliance cannot be achieved earlier than 2024. Such analysis includes:

- exploring whether measures targeted at the last remaining exceedance locations following implementation of a CAZ in 2021 would achieve compliance quicker;
- updating the behavioural assumptions used to model the impact of a CAZ, following the Technical Independent Review Panel (TIRP)'s suggestions;
- providing further sensitivity testing on vehicle upgrade assumptions; and
- demonstrating that a Greater Manchester CAZ D cannot bring forward compliance, including outlining the delivery challenges discussed for a GM wide CAZ D.

3.2 In response to the Ministerial request, 32 Evidence Notes have been produced. Notes 1 to 29 were approved by the Corporate Director, Place on 13th February 2020.

3.3 A further three additional supplementary draft technical Evidence Notes (No. 30 to 32) have been produced and have been issued to JAQU in draft form and are subject to approval, namely:

30. GM CAP: Alternative Sensitivity Test Modelling Summary*

31. GM CAP: Results of tests to assess the optimal charge levels for a Greater Manchester Clean Air Zone*
32. GM CAP: Option for Consultation – Incremental Measures Modelling.*
- 3.4 In the interests of the ongoing working relationship between the 10 GM authorities and JAQU in developing the GM CAP, all of the above reports have been issued to JAQU in draft form, and are now subject to approval.
- 3.5 The evidence base that will underpin the Full Business Case (FBC) is still being developed. Evidence was supplied to JAQU where it was possible to do so, with the recognition that the Notes represented a work-in-progress and that more work is required to properly understand the implications of the analysis from a policy, delivery, legal and analytical assurance perspective.
- 3.6 Contents of the further supplementary Evidence Notes:
- **‘Note 30: GM CAP: Alternative Sensitivity Test Modelling Summary’** sets out the results of a sensitivity test carried out to assess the possible impact of a CAZ D within the Inner Relief Road – in addition to the measures set out in Note 29 - on NO₂ concentrations and achieving compliance in the shortest possible time.
 - **‘Note 31: GM CAP: Results of tests to assess the optimal charge levels for a Greater Manchester Clean Air Zone’** describes modelling that has been carried out to test the impact of different charge levels on behavioural responses (i.e.: whether drivers choose to upgrade or stay and pay) and NO_x emissions.
 - **‘Note 32: GM CAP: Option for Consultation – Incremental Measures Modelling’** sets out the results of a series of tests carried out to test the impact of each proposed Implementation and CAF measure on NO_x emissions and NO₂ concentrations.
- 3.7 Notes 30-32 are unfinished as they may be subject to change before the start of the statutory consultation.
- 3.8 As such, it is considered that notes 30-32 fall within the exception under regulation 12(4)(d) EIR and that, in all the circumstances of the case, the public interest in maintaining the exception outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information.
- 3.9 Notes 30-32 will be published prior to statutory consultation so there will be an appropriate opportunity for public scrutiny of them. It is not considered that the public interest would be served by disclosing at this stage drafts which are incomplete.

3.10 In view of the applicability of the exemption in regulation 12(4)(d) EIR, reports 30-32 will remain unpublished until the beginning of the consultation. Upon publication, copies of these reports will be available at: www.CleanAirGM.com.

4 Recommendation

4.1 The Corporate Director, Place is recommended:

- (i) to approve the following documents for submission to the government's Joint Air Quality Unit; and
- (ii) to note their publication status as set out in the report.

33. GM CAP: Alternative Sensitivity Test Modelling Summary*

34. GM CAP: Results of tests to assess the optimal charge levels for a Greater Manchester Clean Air Zone*

35. GM CAP: Option for Consultation – Incremental Measures Modelling.*

Other Options

None

Reasons for Recommendation

The recommendations will help ensure that the authority complies with the Directions served by the Government in 2017 and 2019, requiring the authority to deliver compliance with legal limits for nitrogen dioxide in the “shortest possible time”.

Finance Officer Clearance JLF

Legal Officer Clearance PC

HEAD OF SERVICE SIGNATURE

